## Kogut v. Cty. of Nassau, et al., 06 CV 6695 (JS) (WDW)

## **Defendants' Proposed Voir Dire**

[\*Plaintiffs' objections & counterproposals in redline and explanations in margin comments]

This is a civil rights action brought by the plaintiffs, John Kogut, John Restivo

## **Description of Case**

and Dennis Halstead, who contend that they were wrongly convicted and imprisoned for 18 years for a rape/murder they did not commit. Plaintiffs contend that their prosecutions, trials and convictions were the result of unconstitutional conduct by individual defendant Nassau County police officers, and that the individual defendant police officers were following unwritten rules for how Nassau County conducted homicide investigations.

Specifically, plaintiffs contend that individual police defendants fabricated and coerced a false confession from plaintiff John Kogut, planted evidence, pressured witnesses into making false statements, and covered up evidence that would have helped plaintiffs show their innocence.

Plaintiffs Kogut, Restivo and Halstead contend that this misconduct violated their constitutional rights in two ways: first, that the police defendants deprived plaintiffs of fair trials, and second, that the police defendants initiated a malicious prosecution of plaintiffs and continued it until John Kogut was acquitted at a retrial, and the charges against John Restivo and Dennis Halstead were dismissed, in 2005. Plaintiffs are seeking money damages from Nassau County.

The Nassau County defendants deny that they engaged in any improper or unlawful conduct. Rather, the <a href="Nassau County defendant">Nassau County defendant</a> police officers and other individuals involved in the <a href="criminal">criminal</a> investigation <a href="contend that they">contend that they</a>, acted in an appropriate and legal manner. <a href="They contend that they">They contend that they</a> investigation <a href="discovered enough reliable evidence to support">discovered enough reliable evidence to support</a> probable cause to <a href="believe there that the prosecutions of arrest-the">believe there that the prosecutions of arrest-the Plaintiffs would succeed</a>. <a href="The">The</a>

**Comment [dlc1]:** See DE353, Docket entry of 8/17/12 and oral order of 8/16/12 holding that standard for probable cause is whether there was probable cause to believe the prosecution would succeed based on the admissible evidence (not probable cause to arrest).

personnel and a voluntary videotaped confession by John Kogut in which he implicated himself and Plaintiffs Halstead and Restivo. In addition, other evidence which established probable cause to arrest the Plaintiffs was discovered by the continuing investigatory work by the many police officers assigned to the case. The legally obtained evidence was properly presented to the Nassau County District Attorney's Office. The District Attorney's Office properly presented this evidence to a Grand Jury of citizens that voted to indict all three Plaintiffs.

The Defendants contend they did not act illegally or with maliceiously. as claimed by the Plaintiffs. I will give you a legal definition of malice and the elements of malicious prosecution later in the case. Defendants contend that they did not coerce confessions or plant any evidence or cover up any investigatory leads. The defendant police officers investigated this case and established probable cause to arrest the individuals who committed the crimes against Theresa Fusco and that probable cause led them to arrest the Plaintiffs.

Comment [dlc2]: See DE353 & Docket entry of 8/17/12 holding that evidence defendants may rely upon in arguing that there was enough admissible evidence to create probable cause to believe the prosecutions would succeed against John Kogut, John Restivo and Dennis Halstead, is limited to evidence that was both listed in defendants' contention interrogatory responses and admissible against each plaintiff in the separate criminal proceedings.

Comment [dlc3]: Violates summary judgment Decision & Order (DE353 at 15) ("... NCPD officers cannot use the prosecutors' decision-making to shield their alleged wrongdoing.").

## Juror Questionnaire

- 1. Have you heard or read anything about this case or plaintiffs John Kogut, John Restivo and Dennis Halstead?
- 2. Is English your native language?
- 3. If employed, what is your occupation?
- 4. How long have you been engaged in your current occupation?
- 5. If you are retired, unemployed, or have been at your current occupation less than five years, what was your previous occupation?
- 6. Do you have any children?
- 7. What is the occupation of your children?

- 8. Do you own your home, do you rent, or do you live with your parents or other family members?
- 9. What is your educational background?
- 10. Have you or any family member had any education, training, or experience in the following areas: DNA testing, Criminal Justice, Corrections, Law Enforcement, Police interrogation, Questioning techniques, Forensic sciences, Private investigations or Security? If yes, explain.
- 11. Are you now, or have you recently been under a doctor's care for mental, emotional, or substance abuse problems?
- 12. Are you taking any medication that could interfere with your ability to serve as a juror?
- 13. Do you have any physical problems that would interfere with your ability to serve as a juror?
- 14. Have you, a family member, or a close friend ever worked or are you applying for a job to work in law enforcement? [Including state or local police and sheriff's departments, the FBI, the Securities and Exchange Commission, any prosecutor's office, the Department of Corrections, or any regulatory agency.]
- 15. Have you, a family member, or a close friend ever been employed by federal, state or local government, including the courts and the post office?
- 16. Have you, a close friend, or family member ever worked in a laboratory or otherwise been involved in any manner whatsoever with any type of scientific analysis?
- 17. Have you ever served in the military?
- 18. What are your hobbies?
- 19. What groups and/or organizations do you and/or your spouse and/or domestic partner belong?
- 20. Have you ever held any office or title in the organizations listed in your answer to the previous question?
- 21. What is your main source for news?
- 22. What newspapers and/or magazines do you read on a regular basis?
- 23. What television shows (including the news) do you watch on a regular basis?
- 24. Have you ever served as a juror at trial?
- 25. Were you the foreperson of the jury?

- 26. What kind of a case did you sit on?
- 27. Did the jury reach a verdict, hung jury or was the case settled?
- 28. Have you ever served as a grand juror?
- 29. Were you the foreperson of the grand jury?
- 30. Have you, any member of your family, or a close friend ever been involved in a criminal proceeding, as either a defendant or a witness? [You may answer at sidebar.]
- 31. Have you, any member of your family, or a close friend ever been involved in a civil lawsuit, as either a plaintiff, defendant or a witness?
- 32. Have you ever testified as a witness at any kind of legal proceeding?
- 33. This case may receive media attention. Will you be able to follow the court's instruction that you are not to watch television, listen to or watch any media coverage or read news about this case on the internet and that the only evidence you are permitted to consider is that which is presented in court?
- 34. The court and the parties estimate that after a jury is selected, this case may last up to six weeks, and possible even longer than that. We will generally not sit on Fridays. Does this schedule provide a hardship? If so, please explain.
- 35. During the course of this proceeding you will be required and asked not to share anything you hear or see with anyone, including your spouse, domestic partner and/or loved ones. Will you have difficulty adhering to these terms?
- 36. Do you have any personal, religious, and/or philosophical beliefs about what the law is or should be that would make it difficult to follow the Court's legal instructions?
- 37. Are you or a close member of your family personally acquainted with any of the following individuals?

Dennis Halstead John Kogut John Restivo Melissa Lullo Jason Halstead Taylor Halstead Heather Halstead Thomas Allen Wayne Birdsall Richard Brusa "Soupy" Campbell

Michael Connaughton

Robert Dempsey

William Diehl

Vincent Donnelly

Robert Edwards

Charles Fraas

Milton Gruber

Anthony Kosior

Albert Martino

Daniel Perrino

Frank Sirianni

Jack Sharkey

Sean Spillane

Joseph Volpe

Harry Waltman

Kogut v. Cty. of Nassau, et al.

Robert Biancavilla

Denis Dillon

Joseph Famighetti

Dennis Farrell

Robert Hillman

Donald Kane

Fred Klein

James Lawrence

**Edward McCarty** 

Michael O'Leary

Theodore Robinson

Peter Weinstein

Bruce Whitney

William J. Willett

Esther Bonasia

Simon Bonasia

Dawn Cockerel

Kenneth Cockerel

Michael Cockerel

Gail Cole

Maureen Corbett

Lorraine DiGiuseppe

Joanne Egington Nitti

John French

Lori French Gabberty

Concetta Napoli Fusco

Victoria Halstead

Kogut v. Cty. of Nassau, et al.

Lisa Kaplan Johnson

Leo Klein

Christopher Lampasona

Paul Lampasona

Frank Meyers

Glen Mielinis

Linda Miller

Iris Morrissey

Kelly Morrissey

Ignatius Napoli

John Nitti

Brian O'Hanlon

Cary O'Hanlon

Carl Pozzini

David Rapp

Walter Rapp, Jr.

Charles Restivo

Frida Restivo

Sheryl Schneider

Donna Schneider

Brian Skellington

David Skellington

Keith Skellington

Debra Smith

Harold Smyle

Robert Bauman

Marcello Baez Edward Beahr

Rochelle Bernstein

Jeremiah Breen

Elizabeth Cagan

Steven Cagan

Anna Campbell

Dorsha Campbell

James Casatelli

Carolann Davies

Thomas DeCrescenzo

Stephen Dorfman

Arthur Fleischman

Thomas Gilhooley

Carey Guerriero

Tara Gonzalez

Scott J. Kovar

Joan Lenahan

Kerry Ann Sellick

Lomando

Dr. Daniel McCarthy

Paul Miller

Samuel Newsome

Linda Norton

John Overs

George Peck

Lisa Price

Walter Poppe

Paul Howard Rauch

Mary Ann Rosino

Vito Schiraldi

Andrew Tursi

Joseph Tayler

Anthony Walsh

Catherine Arther

Dr. Tamara Bloom

Dr. Pasquale Buffolino

Peter DeForest

Alison Claire Domzalski

Dr. John Herr

Max Houck

Prof. Charles Honts

Saul Kassin

Dr. Terry Melton

Richard Ofshe

Dr. Elizabeth Spratt

Faye Ann Springer

Nicholas Petraco

Shawn Weiss

Hans Christian

Anderson

Michael Bachman

Craig Bandini

Paul Bastian

Robert Baxter

Jeremiah Breen

Ernest Breithaupt Charles Burkhard

Elvin Campbell

Michael Cannino

Phillip Caponi

David Devine

Caine Dominici

James Dundon

George Duprey

Stephen Eichner

Daniel Evelly

John William Evelly

Steve Evelly

William Evelly

Art Freelander

Solomon Fulero

John Fusco

Thomas Fusco

Sean Galligan

John Glennon Ronald Grab

Patrick Griffin

John Hemmy

William Hynes

Carmelo Kaplan

Joseph Kronenburg

Gerard Kuster

Benjamin Langdon

Daniel Ludecker

Steven Manchin

Scott Manchin

John Martini

Robert Martini

Thomas McBride

Michael McCarthy

Gregory McManus

Robert Mielinis

Charles Mohr, Jr.

Richard Moyles

Neil Multop

Craig Neiderberger

John Nutini

Roger Ofner

Raymond Pensabene

Jasmani Perez

Charles Price

John Rallo

John Rapp

Salvatore Roseo

Thomas Ryan, Jr.

Alex Sapounas

Gary Scherpple Peter Schlegel

David Shafer

Richard Skewes

R.J. Springsteen

Angelo

Talierico/Talercio

Peter Talierico/Talercio

Scott Tiederman

Steven Toledo

John Torregrossa

Stephen Trapani

John Updigrove

Michael Vogel

John Warner

Matthew Wilson

Michael Wren

Michael Baird

Adele Bernhard

P.O. Blumgrene

Leonard Bonasia

Dorsha Campbell

Meghan E. Clement

Robin Cotton

P.O. Crowe

Debbie DeCarlo

Rachel Doft

Frances Berry Doyle

Joseph Dragotto

Lauren Galbreath

Kate Germond

Thomas Henenlotter

Lucille Klein, aka Roxanne Pizzolo

Lewis Liman

Terry Maroney

Thomas McVann

Michael Morpeau

Nina Morrison

Marge Niedecker

Mechthild Prinz

Anthony Orslini

Alan Schneider

Paul Winke

38. Do you know or have any connection (personal, business, or social) with any of the attorneys for the plaintiffs John Kogut, John Restivo and Dennis Halstead?

- Paul Casteleiro
- Anthony Grandinette, John Serio (Law firm of Grandinette &
- Barry Scheck, Debi Cornnwall, Anna Benvenutti Hoffmann, Sonam Henderson (Law firm of Neufeld Scheck & Brustin LLP).

- 39. Do you know or have any connection (personal, business, or social) with any of the attorneys for the Defendants?
  - Lou Freeman, Lee Ginsberg, Nadjia Limani (Law firm of Freeman, Nooter & Ginsberg)
  - Michael Ferguson (Nasssau County Attorney's Office)
- 40. Have you had any experience (good or bad) with any law enforcement agency that would make it difficult for you to remain fair and impartial throughout this trial?
- 43. Would you tend to give more or less weight to the testimony of a witness who is a law enforcement officer as opposed to any other witness?
- 44. You will hear evidence that the Plaintiffs were originally convicted and sentenced to long prison terms but their convictions were later overturned. However, the issue in this case is not whether the Plaintiffs are guilty or not guilty of the crimes with which they were charged but whether the police violated the constitutional rights of the plaintiffs by depriving them of fair trials and prosecuting them without enough reliable evidence to believe that the prosecutions would succeed. acted properly with probable cause to investigate, arrest and indict the plaintiffs. Will you be able to render a fair and impartial verdict even though the criminal cases against the plaintiffs were dismissed?
- 45. You will hear evidence, that certain DNA evidence found on the body of Theresa Fusco, who was the murder and rape victim, did not match the DNA of any of the Plaintiffs. Will this evidence alone cause you to render a verdict in favor of the Plaintiffs or will you be able to listen to all of the other evidence and the Court's instruction before you decide on a verdict?